1	APPELLATE COURT NO
2	IN THE COURT OF APPEALS
3	OF THE STATE OF TEXAS
4	AT HOUSTON
5	
6	PRESTON HUGHES, III,
7	Appellant,
8	vs.
9	THE STATE OF TEXAS,
10	Appellee.
11	
12	AD"FAL FROM 174TH DISTRICT COURT OF HARRIS COUNTY,
13	TEXAS
14	Judge George H. Godwin, Presiding
15	
16	
1 7	STATEMENT OF FACTS
18	JURY TRIAL
19	MAY 1, 1989
20	VOLUME XVIII OF XXIII VOLUMES
21	
2 <b>2</b>	
23	Carrie Hargis
2 4	Official Court Reporter 301 San Jacinto Houston, Texas 77002
25	nouscon, rexas //ouz

· 3. 18

- 1

1 .	INDEX TO WITNESSES	
2	VCL.	/PAGE
3	MAY 1, 1989	Ì
4	ARRAIGNMENT	18/13
5	OPENING STATEMENT  By the State - Mr. Noll	18/14
¥6	V.L. COOK Direct - Mr. Noll	18/18
7	Cross - Mr. McCullough	18/34
8 ;	D. HAMILTON Direct - Mr. Noll	18/36
9	Voir Dire - Mr. McCullough Direct - Mr. Noll	18/46
150	Cross - Mr. McCullough	18/59
11	Direct - Mr. Noll	18/69 18/100
12	Voir Dire - Mr. McCullough Direct Continued	18/102 18/126
13	CHERYL GRAHAM Out of the presence of the jury - Mr. McCullough	18/140
14 × 15	DENNIS GAFFORD - Continued Cross continued - Mr. McCullough Redirect - Mr. Noil	13/144 18/183
16 17	L.B. SMITH  Direct - Mr. Noll  Cross - Mr. Thomas  Redirect - Mr. Noll	16/166 18/194 18/203
18	THÉRESA ROSS	
19	Direct - Mr. Noll	18/207 18/225
20 / <del>*</del>	Redirect - Mr. Noll D.A. FERGUSON	18/233
21	Direct - Mr. Noll Voir Dire	18/241
22	Out of the presence of the jury - Mr. McCullough Direct continued - Mr. Noll	18/245 18/246
23	Voir Dire - Mr. McCullough Direct continued - Mr. Noll	18/250 18/252
24	Cross - Mr. McCulloughRedirect - Mr. NollVoir dire - Mr. McCullough	18/267 18/285 18/287
25	Redirect continued - Mr. Noll	18/288

I	INDEX TO WITNESSES, cont'd	
2	VOL.	/PAGE
*3	D.A. FERGUSON, Continued  Recross - Mr. McCullough	18/290
4	S.L. CLAPPART	10/002
5	Direct - Mr. Noll	18/293
6	Redirect - Mr. Noll JOHN R. SWAIM	18/311
7	Direct - Mr. Noll	18/313 18/320
<b>*</b> -8	E.T. YANCHAK	30/224
9	Cross - Mr. McCullough	18/324 18/333
10	MAY 19, 1989	
11	MIKAL KLUMPP - Out of the presence of the jury Direct - Mr. Noll	19/354
12	Cross - Mr. McCullough Redirect - Mr. Noll	19/364 19/365
13	Recross - Mr. McCulloughFurther Redirect - Mr. Noll	19/368 19/369
, 14	F.L. HALE	
15	Direct - Mr. Noll	19/374 19/382
16	T.C. BLOYD Direct - Mr. Noll	19/385
17	EVELYN BROWN	19/303
	Direct - Mr. Noll Cross - Mr. McCullough	19/398 19/423
18	MIKAL KLUMPP	,
19	Direct - Mr. Noll	19/426
з 20	Direct - Mr. Noll	19/432
21	Out of the presence of the jury - Mr.McCullough Out of the presence of the jury - Mr. Noll	19/442
22	Direct continued - Mr. Noll	19/445 19/452
23	Redirect - Mr. Noll	19/463
24	Further Redirect- Mr. Noll Further Recross - Mr. McCullough	19/464 19/465
25		
	·	

1	INDEX TO WITNESSES, cont'd	
2		VOL./PAGE
	ROBERT JORDAN,	46875
3	Direct - Mr. Noll	19/432
4	Voir Dire - Mr. McCullough Direct continued - Mr. Noll Voir dire - Mr. McCullough	19/481 19/485 19/504
5	Cross - Mr. McCullough	19/506
	Recross - Mr. McCullough	19/510 19/514
6	Further Redirect - Mr. Noll	19/516
7	CYNTHIA CHARLES Direct - Mr.Noll	19/520
8	Cross - Mr. McCullough	19/528
9	STATE RESTS	19/531
	MOTION for DIRECTED VERDICT	19/532
10	PRESTON HUGHES, III	
11	Out of the presence of the jury-Mr. McCullo	ugh 19/534
• •	SYLVIA WOODS	
12	Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/542
10	Cross - Mr. Noll	19/553
13	Redirect - Mr. McCullough	19/563
14	DETRIA WOODS	
	Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/565
15	Cross - Mr. Noll	19/571 19/584
1.0		22, 22
16	BRENDA JOHNSON	19/586
17	Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/590
18	JOSEPH CASLER Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/592
10	Cross - Mr. Noll	19/599
19	Redirect - Mr. McCullough	19/607
20	BRENDA JOHNSON, recalled	
	Direct - Mr. McCullough Cross - Mr. Noll	19/610
21	Cross - Mr. Noll	19/612
22	ROSALYND CALHOUN	19/615
	Direct - Mr. McCullough Cross - Mr. Noll	19/619
23	Redirect - Mr. McCullough	19/625
24	Recross - Mr. Noll	19/626
24		
25		

1	INDEX TO WITNESSES, cont'd	
2		VOL./PAGE
3	KENNY MOUTON Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/629
4	Cross - Mr. NollRedirect - Mr. McCullough	19/634 19/638
5	ELIZABETH STROMAN Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/639
6	Cross - Mr. Noll	19/649
7	DENNIS GAFFORD Direct - Mr. McCullough	19/665
8	MAY 3, 1989	ï
9	HOPE LEIJA Direct - Mr. McCullough	20/679
10	Voir Dire - Mr. Noll Direct continued - Mr. McCullough	20/684 20/687
11		20/00/
	THOMAS GARCIA Direct - Mr. McCullough	20/690
12	PRESTON HUGHES, III	
13	Direct - Mr. McCullough	20/694 20/726
14	DEFENSE RESTS	20/811
15	REBUTTAL	
16	STEPHEN MARSHBUM, rebuttal Direct - Mr. Noll	20/814
17	Cross - Mr. McCullough	20/829
18	JUNE BUFORD, rebuttal Direct - Mr. Noll	20/831
19	Cross - Mr. McCullough	20/837
17	BILL LILLICO	00.4020
20	Direct - Mr. Noll	20/839 20/843
21	STATE RESTS	20/844
22	DEFENSE CLOSES	20/844
23	OBJECTIONS/CHARGE	20/844
24	 	
25	; ;	

1		INDEX TO	EXHIBITS		
2	No.		Marked	Offered	Admitted
3			VOL./PAGE	VOL./PAGE	VOL./PAGE
4	FOR TH	E STATE:			
5	1	consent to search		18/123	18/123
6	2	consent for blood, urine, and hair		18/123	18/123
7	3 🕯	original statement No. 1	18/23	18/234	18/234
8	4 ి	original statement No. 2	18/342	18/342	18/342
9	5	photo	18/23	18/24	18/24
10	6	pnoto	18/23	18/24	18/24
11	7	phoro	18/30	18/31	18/31
12	3	photo	18/31	18/32	18/32
13	9	photo	18/31	18/32	18/32
14	10	shorts	18/45	18/46	18/48
15	11	shoe	18/45	18/46	18/48
16	12	shoe	18/45	18/46	18/48
	13	photo	18/80	18/80	18/80
17	14	phoċo	18/80	18/92	18/92
18	15	eyeglasses	18/92	19/381	19/382
19	16	blue jeans	18/139	19/381	19/381
20	17	maroon shirt	18/139	19/381	19/382
21	18	blue workshirt	18/139	19/381	19/382
22	19	blue workshirt	18/139	19/381	19/382
23	20	knife	18/139	19/381	19/382
24	21	sheath	18/139	19/381	19/382
	22	vaginal swab	18/139	19/504	19/505
25	23	photo	18/139	18/250	18/251

,					
1	No.	Description	Marked	Offered	Admitted
2	24	photo	18/139	18/250	18/251
3	25	photo	18/139	18/250	18/251
4	26	photo	18/139	18/250	18/251
5	27	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
6	28	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
	29	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
7	30	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
8	31	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
9	32	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
10	33	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
11	34	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
12	35	photo	18/205	18/250	18/251
13	36	photo	18/286	18/287	18/288
	37	photo	18/286	18/287	18/288
14	38	photo	18/286	18/287	18/288
15	39 ,	key	18/289	18/289	18/290
16	40	autopsy report	19/477	19/480	19/484
17	41	autopsy report	19/477	19/480	19/484
18	42	photo	19/477	19/480	19/484
19	43	photo	19/477	19/480	19/484
20	44	photo	19/477	19/480	19/484
	45	photo	20/813	20/816	20/816
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
			<del></del>		

1	No.	Description	Marked	Offerea	Admitted	
2	FOR THE DEFENSE:					
3	1	copy - statement No. 1	2/23	2/78	2/78	
4	2	copy - statement No. 2	2/23	2/78	2/78	
5	3	list of questions	3/386	3/386	3/386	
6	4	inmate request form	3/388	3/391	3/391	
	5 🔀	phone toll statement	3/439	3/440	300 MIN	
7	6	apartment diagram	18/139	18/180	18/180	
8	7	photo	19/585		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	
9	8 -	photo	19/585			
0	9 —	photo	19/585			
1	10-	photo	19/585		non and	
2	11-	photo	19/585			
3	12-	ρίουσ	19/585	<del></del>	over and	
		photo	19/585			
4	14-	photo	19/585			
5	15 —	photo	19/585		und sad	
6	16-	į iroto	19/585			
7	17	list of questions,	19/585	******		
8	18 -	key	19/585	wine see		
9	19-	key	19/593	19/611	19/612	
0	20	phone records in envelope	20/680	20/684	20/686	
1					•	
2						
:3						
4						
:5						

## CAUSE NO. 511676

2 STATE OF TEXAS IN THE 174TH DISTRICT COURT

3 Vs. OF

proceedings were had, viz:

4 PRESTON HUGHES, III HARRIS COUNTY, T E X A S

5

7

8

1

6 APPEARANCES:

For the State: Mr. Chuck Noll

Assistant District Attorney

Harris County, Texas

9

10

11

For the Defendant: Mr. Ellis McCullough

Mr. Al Thomas Attorneys at Law Houston, Texas

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

BE IT REMEMBERED that upon this the 1st day of May, A. D. 1989, the above entitled and numbered cause came on for Jury Trial before the Honorable George H. Godwin, Judge of the 174th District Court of Harris County, Texas; and the State appearing by counsel and the Defendant appearing in person and by counsel, announced ready for Jury Trial and a jury having been selected, impaneled, and sworn and all preliminary matters having been disposed of, the following

24

1 THE COURT: Do you have any witnesses in 2 the courtroom, Mr. McCullough? 3 MR. McCULLOUGH: Are any of the people 4 in the courtroom subpoenaed by Preston Hughes to 5 be here today besides Ms. Stroman? I think my 6 witnesses are in the hall, the ones that are here. 7 Mr. Hughes informs me he wants Ms. Stroman to notarize a motion for him he wants to 8 9 file before we start. 1.0 THE COURT: I'm sorry. We're not going 11 to do that right now. We'll get to it at the 12 appropriate time. We're going to move along. 13 MR. McCULLOUGH: I have no witnesses in 14 the courtroom, Your Honor. 15 THE COURT: Are there any in the hall 16 that need to be sworn? 17 MR. NOLL: You want us to bring in 18 everyone we can, Your Honor? 19 THE COURT: Please. 20 (Witnesses enter courtroom.) 21 THE COURT: Would everyone who intends 22 to testify in the State of Texas versus Preston 23 Hughes, please stand and raise your right hand. 24 (Witnesses sworn.)

THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, the

Rule will be invoked. What the Rule means is that the witnesses may not remain inside the courtroom while the other ones are testifying. Do not discuss your testimony with any of the other witnesses. Do not discuss your testimony before or after testifying with any of the other witnesses. You may discuss your testimony with the lawyers in the case. If you are discussing it with the lawyers in the case, make sure that when you do so, it is not within the hearing of any other witness.

Now, do you have any other problems with ---would the witnesses who have been subpoenaed by Preston Hughes through Mr. McCullough or Mr. Al Thomas, would you please remain in attendance this morning until you have been talked to by either Mr. Charles Mallone or Mr. Ellis McCullough. They will make arrangements to place you on call and let you leave and tell you when to be back down here. All the other witnesses, unless you're specifically excused by the Court, you will remain in the hallway.

Mr. Noll, do you need an attachment on some witnesses?

MR. NOLL: Yes, Your Honor. Two

```
1
      witnesses have not responded to their subpoena.
      Shawn Graham or Carol Graham.
 2
                THE COURT:
                            I can't understand the last
 3
             Grant?
 4
      name.
 5
                MR. NOLL: Graham, Your Honor,
 6
      G-r-a-h-a-m.
 7
                THE COURT:
                            Shawn Graham or Carol Graham?
                MR. NOLL: Shawn and Carol Graham.
 8
 9
                THE COURT:
                            Writs of attachment will be
10
      issued for those witnesses. Mr. McCullough, Mr.
      Thomas, do y'all have any problems?
11
12
                MR. McCULLOUGH: We don't know yet.
13
                THE COURT: Very well. I expect you to
14
      let the Court know in the appropriate amount of
15
      time so the appropriate writs of attachments may
16
      be issued. Very well. You may be excused to wait
17
      outside in the hallway.
                          (Witnesses exit the courtroom.)
18
                THE COURT: Mr. Noll, are you going to
19
20
      make an opening statement?
21
                MR. NOLL: Yes, Your Honor, I am.
22
                THE COURT: Mr. McCullough, will you be
23
      following his or wait until your own case to make
24
      one or at all?
                MR. McCULLOUGH: I will wait until I
25
```

open my case, if at all.

THE COURT: Very well.

MR. McCULLOUGH: I have one matter to take up as soon as the witnesses have excused themselves from the courtroom. Brenda Johnson, the defendant's mother's in the courtroom. Ms. Johnson, do you intend to testify in this case either in the first phase of the trial; or if there is a punishment phase, in the second phase of the trial?

MS. JOHNSON: What phase would you be referring to?

MR. McCULLOUGH: Well, it's somewhat your and Mr. Hughes' option whether you testify or not. I know you don't know anything about the case --

MS. JOHNSON: Somewhat about the facts.

MR. McCULLOUGH: The problem is, if you're going to testify in the case, you have to be sworn and put under the Rule. The State may or may not waive the Rule in your case. If you're going to testify, you may well be excluded from the courtroom during the trial. So, we need to make that decision.

MS. JOHNSON: I will testify.

MR. McCULLOUGH: Then I'll ask Ms. Johnson to be sworn and put under the Rule.

(Witness sworn.)

MR. McCULLOUGH: We would ask the Rule be waived with regard to Ms. Johnson.

MR. NOLL: Your Honor, we would object to the waiving of the Rule. We don't have any idea what her testimony might be, but I would object to her being present during the other witnesses' testimony.

THE COURT: I will tell you I can't rule without knowing. If she intends to be a witness at the punishment phase of the trial, if there is a punishment phase of the trial, I would be inclined to waive the Rule. If there is the remotest possibility that she may be a witness during any case that you choose to put on, I will not waive the requirements of the Rule.

MR. McCULLOUGH: I feel like there is more than a remote possibility she will testify as to some facts indirectly related.

THE COURT: Ms. Johnson, will you have a seat outside, please. Please remain on call.

(Ms. Johnson exits courtroom.)

THE COURT: Anything else, gentlemen?

MR. NOLL: I have one more witness, Mr.

Jamie Hunter, who I spoke with Friday, indicated
he would be here this morning. I haven't yet seen
him. He is my first witness, a very short witness.

If I could have a moment to check in the hallway
to see if he's here yet.

1.3

THE COURT: No. You can start with another witness if you don't know if he's here. That's why we went through these machinations, so we would not be waiting for witnesses. Anything else?

MR. NOLL: Your Honor, with all due respect, this witness is very short, only take a couple of minutes.

THE COURT: Why do we need to wait on him if he's going to take a couple of minutes?

MR. NOLL: Taking him out of order will substantially disrupt the presentation of the State's case in this matter. It makes no sense to appear all of a sudden, after the officers at the scene. He is the one that found the deceased. I'll see if I can find him. I may have to work around him.

THE COURT: Very well. See if Mr. Hunter is here.

1 (Mr. Noll exits courtroom.) 2 MR. McCULLOUGH: I don't see why Mr. 3 Noll has to be present to start this issue. It just occurred to me that the relative of one of 4 5 the victims has apparently made threats against 6 Mr. Hughes to the District Attorney, which seem to 7 be, were they to be taken seriously, I was 8 wondering if we could take some steps to ensure 9 that if that person comes here, at least, that they're not armed. 10 11 (Mr. Noll enters courtroom.) 12 MR. McCULLOUGH: Do you know who I'm 1.3 talking about? 14 MR. NOLL: I don't know. I wasn't 15 present --16 MR. McCULLOUGH: The lady who said she 17 was going to get a gun and kill Preston. 18 going to be here? 19 MR. NOLL: I doubt seriously if Ms. 20 Sharon Brown, the mother of the 3-year-old victim in this case, is going to be here. Last week she 21 22 was committed against her will to the Rusk State 23 Hospital because of extreme depression over the 24 death of her child.

25

THE COURT: The Court is aware and will

take precautions to try this case consistent with the rules of justice and fair play without any outside distractions whatsoever. We will maintain security in the courtroom for the parties and the witnesses and the spectators. Anything else?

MR. McCULLOUGH: I have nothing further.

MR. NOLL: No, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Is Mr. Hunter present?

MR. NOLL: I can't find Mr. Hunter out there. I'll have to proceed without him.

THE COURT: Very well. Let's bring in the jury. I plan to admonish them. You may make your opening statements and then we'll see if Mr. Hunter is here.

(Jury in.)

THE COURT: Would the jurors please rise and raise your right hands.

(Jury sworn.)

admonishments as you were selected during the voir dire portion of the trial. I would like to give you-all now, as a group, the following admonishments, which will apply throughout the hearing of testimony in your deliberations in this case.

Do not discuss the case among yourselves or with anyone else at any time. What I mean by that is you will hear testimony. There will be breaks in the trial. Do not begin to discuss the testimony that you hear or anything about the case. The only time for you to do that is after you have heard all the testimony, after you've been given the Court's charge, and after you've heard the arguments of counsel.

Do not allow anyone to talk to you about the case. If anyone does try to talk to you, report it to me or the bailiff immediately. I don't know if there's going to be anything reported in the media about this case, but do not read anything about it, turn off a radio, turn off the TV. If you even think you're starting to read something or hear something about it, do not pay any attention to it whatsoever.

We will keep you in a group as much as possible while you are down here. We will make arrangements for your lunch to take you in a group. Again, do not begin to discuss the case or anything about it during the testimony as it comes out.

There will be juror badges for you

presently. Please wear those on an outside article of your clothing while you are in the courthouse on your way to and from the courthouse, please. The reason for that is so that the people in the courthouse will know that you are a juror and will hopefully watch their comments. We don't want to take the chance that anything untoward would be said in front of you at this time.

Please do not go into any of the other courtrooms in the courthouse. I would normally encourage you to do that but please don't do that. There may be a case in trial or in some stage of its trip through the criminal justice system. I can't control that. I don't know what you may hear or may not hear but I just don't want to take the chance that anything you see or hear in another courtroom would influence your verdict in this case.

That is basically all I have to say.

Thank you again. We're getting a little late start this morning. Hopefully, we'll try to take care of that and start on time and move along on schedule and get this case heard as quickly as we can, consistent with the rules of justice and fair play.

1 Mr. Noll, you may present the indictment. 2 MR. NOLL: If it please the Court. the name and by authority of the State of Texas, 3 the duly organized grand jury of Harris County, 5 Texas, presents in the district court of Harris County, Texas, that in Harris County, Texas, Preston Hughes, III, hereafter styled the 7 8 defendant, heretofore on or about September 26th, 1988, did then and there unlawfully, intentionally 9 10 and knowingly, cause the death of Shandra Charles, 11 hereafter styled the complainant, by stabbing and 12 cutting the complainant with a deadly weapon, 13 namely, a knife; and during the same criminal 14 transaction, the defendant did then and there 15 unlawfully, intentionally, and knowingly, cause 16 the death of Marcell Taylor, by stabbing and cutting Marcell Taylor with a deadly weapon, 17 18 namely, a knife.

Against the peace and dignity of the State and signed by the foreman of the grand jury.

THE COURT: To which the defendant has pleaded not guilty.

You may be seated.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Mr. Noll, does the State have an opening statement?

MR. N

MR. NOLL: We do, Your Honor.

THE COURT: You may proceed.

## OPENING STATEMENT

## BY THE STATE

8 "

<sub>es</sub> 9

- 13

<del>\_1</del>4

MR. NOLL: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. On September 26th, 1988, about 10:30 or 11:00 o'clock at night, in a field between the Fuddrucker's on Kirkwood on the west side of town at an apartment complex, a 15-year-old girl and her 3-year-old cousin were attacked and stabbed to death. I think the evidence will show you the little girl was sexually assaulted in addition to being stabbed. An employee found the little girl.

I think the evidence will show you the path the children were on is frequently used by tenants of the apartment complex as they go back and forth from their apartment complex to stores located on the other side of Kirkwood. The children were found; a police officer, as he cradled Shandra Charles in his arms, asked her what had happened --

MR. McCULLOUGH: Objection, Your Honor, going to be hearsay conversation. I intend to

have it excluded in the trial.

THE COURT: That will be overruled.

MR. NOLL: Testimony will show you that Sergeant Hamilton of the west side station will tell you that child told him, "He tried to rape me."

Sergeant Hamilton said, "Who?"

She said, "Preston tried to rape me."

I expect the evidence to show you that Houston Police sergeants from the homicide division investigated the case, came out to the scene, talked to Sergeant Hamilton, and just using plain old fashioned footwork, went to the apartments that were right next door to the vacant field, asked the people there, "Do you have anybody named Preston that lives here?"

Evidence will show you they learned that Preston Hughes, III, lived in the Lakehurst apartments, not even 200 feet from the spot where that dead baby was found.

The evidence is going to show you that they asked Preston -- at this point they didn't -- have enough to think he did it or know he did it. So, they asked him to come downtown and answer some questions.

The evidence is going to show you that

1

-22

Preston Hughes went with these officers downtown and voluntarily gave a statement. He gave them two. First statement, he admitted stabbing the little girl. Didn't say anything about the sexual assault, didn't say anything about the little boy. Then the same morning, later that morning, the evidence is going to show you again a second statement, where he admits that he sexually assaulted that little girl and then stabbed her to death and then stabbed that 3-year-old child to death, and then went back to his apartment to get the scores on the Monday night football game. I think the evidence and the facts in this case are then going to show you that this confession does match up with the known physical facts.

After you hear the evidence in this case, there is going to be absolutely no doubt at all in your mind as to the guilt of Preston Hughes, III, for the murder of Shandra Charles and her 3-year-old cousin, Marcell Taylor.

Your Honor, the State would call as its first witness Officer Cook.

THE COURT: Do you want to recheck the hall for Mr. Hunter?

MR. NOLL: Yes, Your Honor, if I might.

(Brief pause.) THE COURT: Officer, please keep your voice up. There's an air conditioning vent out there, the microphone is incredibly fuzzy. So, we're going to rely on you to speak up so everybody can hear, okay. MR. NOLL: May I proceed, Your Honor? THE COURT: You may proceed.